

## Halacha Highlight

### Lighting the Menorah inside

Shulchan Aruch siman 671 : 5

**ובשעת הסכנה שאינו רשאי לקים המצוה מניחו על שלחנו ודין**  
**During times of danger when one is not allowed to**  
**fulfill the mitzvah one should place the menorah on**  
**his table and that is sufficient**

Shulchan Aruch mentions that during times of danger the practice is to light the menorah inside on the table. Rema also (סעיף ח') mentions that in his time everyone lit the menorah inside. A fundamental question raised by many later authorities is why nowadays we continue to light the Chanukah menorah inside when it is not dangerous to light outside. Darkei Moshe (סימן תרע"א סק"ט) writes in the name of Rabbeinu Yeruchum that we light inside when there is a concern for thieves. Kol Bo (הלכות חנוכה) gives another explanation that is unrelated to danger. He writes that when there is a concern that gentiles may extinguish the lights we kindle the lights inside.

Aruch HaShulchan (סעי' כ"ד) suggests that we light the menorah inside because of the harsh weather conditions that are common during Chanukah. In order to protect the flame from the rain, snow and strong winds it would be necessary to enclose the menorah in a glass case and Chazal did not enact the mitzvah in a manner that would require this degree of effort. Consequently it is common practice to light the menorah inside. A difficulty with this approach is that Rav Yaakov Emden (שו"ת שאילת יעביץ ח"א סי' קמ"ט) demonstrates that even in the time of Chazal it was necessary to surround the menorah with glass due to the likelihood that wind would extinguish the flame. Accordingly, it is difficult to assert that we light the menorah inside to avoid the effort needed to enclose the menorah in glass.

Teshuvos Lehoros Nossan (ח"ד סי' ס"ג) maintains that when Chazal enacted the obligation to kindle the menorah outside, their intent was to publicize the miracle amongst the Jews who lived nearby since there is no value to publicizing the miracle for the

## Overview

### Siman 671 Seif 5:

Chanukah lights should be placed by the entrance that is adjacent to the public domain. One who lives on a second story without an entrance to the public domain should place his lights by a window that faces the public domain. During dangerous times it is sufficient to put the lights on one's table [inside]. When lighting inside one must have another light that will be used for illumination.

- ❖ The lights are placed outside in order to publicize the miracle. (M.B. 21)
- ❖ Another light is necessary to demonstrate that one is not using the Chanukah lights for personal use. (M.B. 24)

### Siman 671 Seif 6:

The lights should be placed higher than three *tefachim* and it is a mitzvah to place them below ten *tefachim*. If they were placed higher than twenty *amos* the mitzvah is not fulfilled. Even if one took the lights [from above twenty *amos*] and lowered them within twenty *amos* the mitzvah is not fulfilled.

- ❖ When placed less than three *tefachim* of the ground it is not recognizable that they were placed there by the homeowner but the mitzvah is nevertheless fulfilled. (M.B. 26)
- ❖ Eliyah Rabbah gives a reason why people are not particular to place the Chanukah lights within ten *tefachim* of the ground, but he says that those who are particular in their mitzvah observance place their Chanukah lights within ten *tefachim* of the ground. (M.B. 27)
- ❖ One who lives on a second story places it by the window even if it is more than ten *tefachim* off the floor. In shul the Chanukah lights are placed on a high place. (M.B. 27)

gentiles. Accordingly, since nowadays we live amongst gentiles there is no reason to light the menorah outside and thus common practice is to light the menorah inside.