The Chicago Center
Digest
Mishna Berura
THE DAILY RESOURCE FOR MISHNA BERURA YOMI
Fri, Sep 29 2023 ■ י"ד תשרי, תשפ"ד
סימן תרנ"א סעיף י'-י"ב

Overview

Siman 651 Seif 10:

When shaking the *lulav* one goes to the right, meaning east, south, west and then north.

- There is no difference between a righty and lefty. One begins facing east with the spine of the *lulav* facing him and he stretches his hands and brings them back three times shaking the *lulav* as he does so. When bringing it close he should bring his hands close to his body. He then tips the top of the *lulav* to the south and shakes three times but does not have to turn his face in that direction. When shaking to the west he tips the top of the *lulav* over his shoulder and then shakes to the north following the same procedure. Lastly he shakes it up and then down. (M.B. 47)

Siman 651 Seif 11:

He must hold the *esrog* next to the *lulav* when shaking and shakes them together. (The shaking is not essential and if he shook them in any direction, *b'dieved*, he fulfilled his obligation.)

- If he doesn't shake them altogether he still fulfills the *mitzvah*. (M.B. 49)

Siman 651 Seif 12:

The four species are essential to one another and if one is missing one of the species he does not recite the *beracha* on the others but he should hold them to commemorate the *mitzvah* (whether on the 1st day or on the 2nd day)**. If all four were available and he took them one at a time he fulfills his obligation** provided that they were all present in front of him. He should take the *lulav* first and recite the *beracha* on the *lulav* with the other species in mind and if he spoke before taking the other species he must recite a *beracha* on each one separately.

- He does not recite the *beracha* even if he anticipates their arrival. (M.B. 50)
- Maharshal maintains that only the *shaliach tzibbur* takes the species that he has whereas Elya Rabba contends that everyone should take the species that they have and Shulchan Aruch's wording supports this position. (M.B. 51)
- Not only is binding them together not essential but even taking them at once is not essential. (M.B. 52)
- Since the *beracha* mentions the *lulav* it should be taken first. (M.B. 54)
- Meaning of the *hadas* he recites על נטילת עץ עבות, on the *aravah* he recites על נטילת ערבה and the same is done for the *esrog*. It is preferred to later take them all at once. If one recited the *beracha* and then realized he was missing one of the species or that one of them was invalid, if he has a replacement in the house so that he does not have to interrupt he should take them all and recite the *beracha* on the one that was missing or invalid and on the 1st day would repeat *she'hechiyanu* for the one that was missing or invalid. If a replacement is not readily available, when he obtains the missing one he repeats the *beracha* on the *lulav* and on the 1st day would repeat *she'hechiyanu*. (M.B. 56)

Halacha Highlight

The procedure for shaking the *lulav*

Shulchan Aruch Siman 651 Seif 10
יקיף דרך ימין בענענו

He should go around to the right as he shakes the *lulav*

Shulchan Aruch (סעי' י) writes that the correct order for shaking the *lulav* is to turn to the right. Therefore, since one begins facing east, after shaking the *lulav* facing that direction he turns to the right (south), after shaking in that direction he turns again to the right (west) and after shaking in that direction turns to the right again (north) before shaking the *lulav* up and down while facing east. The rationale behind this procedure is Chazal's instruction that whenever one could turn right or left, he should always choose the right. Be'er Heitev (סק"כ) cites Kisvei Arizal who has a different order. According to Arizal the order is south, north, east, up, down and finally west and all of these shakings are performed while facing east.

Kabbalists point out that these directions correspond to the *sefiros*. South – *chessed*, north – *gevurah*, east – *tiferes*, up – *netzach*, down – *hod* and west – *yesod*. For this reason even those *batei kenisiyos* that *daven* facing south or north should make sure to begin shaking to the south rather than to the right since the right of one facing south is west which corresponds to *yesod*. In contrast, one who follow Shulchan Aruch's procedure will always begin in the direction that he is facing and then turns to the right (פסקי תשובות אות י"ג).

Poskim rule that there is no issue if in one *bais haknesses* there are some people who shake the *lulav* following Shulchan Aruch's procedure and others following Arizal's procedure. The reason is that it is only when it comes to *halachic* matters is there a potential issue of different people following different practices but when it comes to customs it is acceptable for different people to follow different courses of action. Proof to this is the Mishnah in Sukkah (37) that relates that although the members of a *bais haknesses* were shaking their *lulavim,* Rabban Gamliel and R' Yehoshua would only shake their *lulav* while reciting אנא ה' הושיעה נא (פסקי תשובות אות י"ג).