The Chicago Center
Digest
Mishna Berura
THE DAILY RESOURCE FOR MISHNA BERURA YOMI
Wed, Sep 27 2023 ■ י"ב תשרי, תשפ"ד
סימן תרנ"א סעיף ה'-ז'

Overview

Siman 651 Seif 5:

One recites the *beracha* על נטילת לולב and שהחיינו before taking the *esrog* so that it is recited before the *mitzvah*. Alternatively, one can turn over the *esrog* until he recites the *beracha*. The *beracha* is recited while standing and is not recited more than once a day even if it is taken multiple times during the day.

- It is recited before taking the *esrog* so that it is recited immediately before the fulfillment of the *mitzvah*. (M.B. 24)
- The stem is on top and after the recitation of the *beracha* one turns it over so that it is held the way that it grows. Bais Yosef writes that one should take the *esrog* with the *pitum* on top but have in mind not to fulfill the *mitzvah* until after the *beracha* and Gra maintains that this is the preferred option. (M.B. 25)
- If one forgot to recite the *beracha* before taking the מינים ד' it can be recited afterwards since shaking the *lulav* is also a *mitzvah*. (M.B. 26)
- *B'dieved* if one recited the *beracha* and performed the *mitzvah* while sitting he has fulfilled his obligation. (M.B. 27)

Siman 651 Seif 6:

***She'hechiyanu* is not recited when one makes the *lulav*, it is recited when it is taken for the *mitzvah*.**

- Chaye Adam writes that if one did not recite the *beracha* on the 1st day it may be recited even on the 7th day when he takes the *lulav*. (M.B. 29)

Siman 651 Seif 7:

If one made a handle and inserted the *lulav* into it he fulfills the *mitzvah* since taking something with another material is considered taking it provided that the other object is honorable. If it is not honorable, for example, it was inserted into a utensil and taken, he does not fulfill the *mitzvah*. If one wrapped the *lulav* in a kerchief and took it or if he wrapped his hands in a kerchief and took the *lulav* according to some authorities he does not fulfill the *mitzvah*. The custom is to remove one's *tefillin* and rings from his hands but technically it is not required since they do not cover his entire hand.

- One grasps the handle made by the kerchief so that none of the *lulav* is in his hand. Elya Rabba maintains that the handle beautifies the *mitzvah* and even if he holds the *lulav* in his hand the *mitzvah* is fulfilled and does not constitute an interposition. (M.B. 30)
- Even if the utensil is made from silver he does not fulfill the *mitzvah*. (M.B. 31)
- The kerchief is an interposition and according to others it is not considered as though he took it completely. (M.B. 32)
- The same is true if he wore gloves. (M.B. 33)
- It is written in the name of Arizal that one should recite the *beracha* in the *sukkah* and then perform the remainder of the shaking in the *bais haknesses*. (M.B. 34)
- Some maintain that one should remove his *tefillin* altogether before taking the *lulav*. (M.B. 35)
- Some authorities write that *halachically* there is an issue of an interposition even though his hand is not covered and thus if it was taken before removing one's *tefillin* or his ring, it should be taken a second time without repeating the *beracha*. (M.B. 36)

Halacha Highlight

Taking and placing down the *lulav* and *esrog*

Shulchan Aruch Siman 651 Seif 5
קדם שיטל האתרוג

Before taking the *esrog*

Shulchan Aruch (סע' ה') writes that one should recite the *berachah* on the *lulav* as well as *she'hechiyanu* before taking the *esrog*. Alternatively, he can invert the *esrog* and hold it with the stem on top while reciting the *beracha* and then turn it over so that the *pitum* is on top for the shaking of the *lulav*. Mishnah Berurah (ס"ק כ"ה) in the name of Bais Yosef presents another method which is to take the *lulav* in the normal manner but with the intent not to fulfil the *mitzvah* until after the recitation of the *beracha* and Gra maintains that this is the preferred approach. The issue involved is that the preferred time to recite a *beracha* on a *mitzvah* is immediately before the performance of the *mitzvah* but the *mitzvah* of *lulav* is to take it. It is not logical to recite the *beracha* while the *lulav* is still in its utensil, nor can the *beracha* be recited after one took it in his hand since by then he already fulfilled the *mitzvah*. To solve this quandary the *Poskim* offer their respective suggestions.

It is clear, however, that one first takes the *lulav* and then the *esrog*. Chaye Adam (כלל קמ"ח סע' י') writes explicitly that one should first take his *lulav* and then the *esrog* and Kaf HaChaim (אות נ"ט) confirms that this is the custom. However, Magen Avrohom (סק"ח), in the name of Shelah, writes that one should first take the *esrog* and then the *lulav* since the *pasuk* that presents this *mitzvah* first mentions the *esrog* and then the *lulav*. There is a similar debate concerning the correct procedure for placing down the *lulav* and *esrog*. Magen Avrohom writes that one should first place down the *lulav* and then the *esrog*. He explains that just like by *tefillin* we put on the *shel yad* before the *shel rosh* but when removing them we remove the *shel rosh* and then the *shel yad*, so too with regards to *lulav* and *esrog* we should place down what was taken second. Dagul Mairivavah challenges Magen Avrohom's assertion that the *lulav* is put down first and even questions the parallel he drew from *tefillin* and concluded that one should place down the *esrog* and then the *lulav* and this was the practice of Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach (הליכות שלמה סוכות פי"א ארחות הלכה הע' 75).