The Chicago Center
Digest
Mishna Berura
THE DAILY RESOURCE FOR MISHNA BERURA YOMI
Shabbos, Sep 23 2023 ■ ח' תשרי, תשפ"ד
סימן תרנ"א סעיף א'

Overview

Siman 651 Seif 1:

The *mitzvah* of ד' מינים is for each person to take one *lulav*, two *aravos* and three *hadasim* (and in a pressing circumstance where there are no valid *hadasim* it is sufficient to take one branch, even if the top was clipped) **and it is a *mitzvah* to bind them together to beautify them with a full knot, meaning a double knot. It is acceptable to bind them with another material. If leaves from a branch in the bundle are severed in a manner that they intervene, it is not an issue** (since a material does not intervene on itself but another material is an interposition, therefore, one should remove the string that is used to bind *hadasim*.) **If one did not bind them during the day or if the knot was untied, it may not be knotted on Yom Tov with a full knot, rather one should tie it with a bow.** Some write that one should make the knot in a different manner by winding the string around the bundle and then inserting the ends into the wrapping and this is the custom. One should position the *hadas* higher than the *aravah*. One should lower the *hadas* and *aravah* low enough that one could grasp all three species while reciting the *beracha*. Some maintain that the *lulav* should contain three knots and that is our custom.

- On the 1st day of Yom Tov one should go to a place that has ד' מינים rather than a place where they are *davening* since *lulav* is a Biblical *mitzvah* and this is true even if there is only a possibility that they will have a *lulav* but on the 2nd day he should go to the place they are *davening*. (M.B. 1)
- If one had only one *aravah* he must take the bundle again. (M.B. 3)
- This is true even if the tops of each branch were clipped but one may not take less than three branches even if they are intact. (M.B. 4)
- This refers to where one cannot obtain them from others but if he can, he should but Bikurei Yaakov is lenient in this case and it appears to me that one should not be lenient about this on the 1st day. (M.B. 5)
- Sha'arei Teshuvah maintains that one should not recite the *beracha* but others imply that one may recite the *beracha*. Magen Avrohom cites Ramban who permits the recitation of the *beracha* even for one branch that is clipped and one may rely on this in a pressing circumstance but in this instance he does not recite the *beracha*. (M.B. 6)
- Although there is no obligation to bind them it beautifies the *mitzvah*. (M.B. 7)
- A knot as opposed to a bow. Teshuvas Agurah B'Ohaleichah writes that inserting the *lulav* into a basket also constitutes a knot. (M.B. 8)
- *Hadasim* were purchased from gentiles in bundles and Shulchan Aruch is teaching that one must remove that string since it is not the material of the ד' מינים and does not beautify the bundle. (M.B. 10)

Halacha Highlight

Binding the *lulav* with a basket and rings

Shulchan Aruch Siman 651 Seif 1
ומצוה לאגדם
And it is a mitzvah to bind them

Shulchan Aruch writes that there is a *mitzvah* for one to bind together the *hadasim* and *aravos* with his *lulav* in order to beautify the *mitzvah*. This is done, he explains, by tying a double knot around the three species. Mishnah Berurah (סק"ז) notes that although there is no obligation to bind together the three species, nevertheless, there is a *mitzvah* to do so based on the general obligation to beautify *mitzvah* objects as derived from the words זה קלי ואנוהו. Regarding the requirement to tie a knot, Mishnah Berurah (סק"ח) explains that what Shulchan Aruch is excluding is tying a bow since it is not prohibited to tie a bow on Shabbos and Yom Tov and thus it does not create an אגד. He then relates that תשובת אגורה באהלך concludes that the basket made from *lulav* leaves into which one inserts his *lulav* satisfies the requirement of a knot and thus the use of it properly fulfills the *mitzvah* to bind together the three species.

Chasam Sofer (חידושים למס' סוכה ל"ו. ד"ה במינו) and Bikurei Yaakov (סק"ז וסק"ח) reject this position and contend that the *mitzvah* of binding together the three species can only be satisfied if one ties an actual knot that is prohibited to tie on Shabbos and Yom Tov. The reason they give is that Chazal instructed us how to properly beautify the *mitzvah* and although it appears to us as though a basket and rings makes the *mitzvah* even more beautiful, nevertheless, we are obligated to beautify the *mitzvah* in the way described by Chazal rather than according to our own subjective perspective. Furthermore, the knot that one ties must be tight enough that one would not be able to remove the *hadasim* and *aravos* without untying the knot. Although it is appropriate to be stringent about this matter, many people have the custom to use the basket and rings and do not bind the species together with a double knot (פסקי תשובות אות ב').

- When Rema notes that the custom is to wrap the string around, Magen Avrohom asserts that the custom is to do so during the week as well but it requires further research whether that is the custom. (M.B. 11)
- The reason is kabbalistic. The *hadas* should be in the right and the *aravah* on the left and Pri Megadim writes that a lefty positions them the same as a righty. (M.B. 12)
- It would seem that the bottom knot that binds the three species together is one of the three knots but others maintain that one should have three knots besides the one at the bottom that holds the three species together. If one tied only knot it is valid. Authorities write that one should bind them in a manner that allows the leaves to rustle, therefore, the top *tefach* should not be bound. (M.B. 14)