The Chicago Center
Digest
Mishna Berura
THE DAILY RESOURCE FOR MISHNA BERURA YOMI
Thurs, Feb 15 2024 ■ ו' אדר א' תשפ"ד
סימן שי"ט סעיף י"ז

Halacha Highlight

Removing the film from cooked milk

Shulchan Aruch Siman 319 Seif 17

המחבץ תולדת בורר הוא

Churning is a subcategory of selecting

Shulchan Aruch rules that one who extracts butter from milk (churning) has transgressed the Biblical prohibition of selecting. Mishnah Berurah (ס"ק ס"ב) adds that included in the prohibition of churning is any action that one does to cause one component of milk to separate from the milk. Thus it is prohibited to add rennet or some other agent to cause milk to curdle. Similarly, it is prohibited to pour curdled milk into a utensil if the intent is for the whey to become separated. A third example is one who separates cream that floats on top of milk. However, it is permitted to remove the cream if one removes some milk together with the cream.

Poskim debate the permissibility of removing the film that develops when cooking milk. Rav Moshe Feinstein (אג"מ או"ח ח"ד סי' ע"ד) compares this film to a peel and just like it is permitted to remove the peel of an onion or garlic on Shabbos in order to be able to access the edible inside, so too, it is permitted to remove the film that rests on top of the milk in order to access the milk. Furthermore, the case of the film is more lenient than the allowance to remove the peel of an onion of garlic since the film on milk is edible, as opposed to the peel of an onion or garlic. Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach (שמירת שבת כהלכתה פ"ג סע' מ"ז והע' קל"ה), however, maintains that it is prohibited to remove the film on top of cooked milk and explains why film on milk is not the same as an onion or garlic peel. It is not possible to reach the edible part of an onion or garlic without removing the peel and thus it could be considered the manner of eating. The film on cooked milk could be separated from the milk by simply holding the film in place so that he could pour the milk out beneath it. Since it is possible to access the milk without having to remove the film it is subject to the guidelines of selecting.

Overview

Siman 319 Seif 17:

Mechabetz **- Churning** (meaning extracting butter from milk) **is a subset of selecting. Therefore, even though one may place sesame and nuts in honey one may not collect them by hand** (See below *siman* 340:11). One who spits into the wind so that the wind scatters the saliva he is liable for winnowing.

- These rulings apply when one wishes to eat the food on Shabbos because to do so for the week is certainly prohibited since one may not prepare on Shabbos for the week. If one is concerned that the food may ruin it is permitted to ask a gentile to do something that is not a *melacha* to prevent a loss since it is only Rabbinically prohibited to ask a gentile to do something to prepare for the week and that injunction is not in force when one will suffer a financial loss. (M.B. 62)
- Included in the prohibition is placing milk in a warm place to make cheese. One who takes curdled milk and makes cheese has violated the prohibition of construction since gathering different parts and combining them together into a single unit is an act of construction. (M.B. 63)
- The implication is that the issue is selecting and for that reason if one intends to eat immediately it is permitted but others maintain that the issue is kneading and accordingly it would be prohibited even if one intended to eat it immediately. (M.B. 64)
- In other words one may not gather it by hand to separate it from the honey. Tosefta implies that it is permitted to remove a thick food from gravy with a spoon since that is the normal manner of eating. (M.B. 66)
- We do not find people concerned for this since it is not their intent. (M.B. 67)