



Overview

Siman 318 Seif 5:

There is an opinion that maintains that one violates the prohibition against cooking if one cooks a food in liquid that was baked or roasted and thus it is prohibited to place bread, even in a *kli sheni*, in liquid that is *yad soledes bo* but others permit this in a *kli sheni*. Some permit this even in a *kli rishon*. The custom is to be stringent *l'chatchila* not to place bread in a *kli sheni* as long as the contents are still *yad soledes bo*.

- ❖ In other words, one is placing the baked or roasted food into a pot that contains hot liquid. (M.B. 40)
- ❖ This opinion maintains that a roasted food could be cooked and this is true even if the food remains hot from being roasted. This opinion also maintains that it is prohibited to roast a food that was cooked. All opinions agree that a roasted food is not subject to further roasting, however, a roasted food should not be placed on the bottom of an oven unless it rests on an empty utensil so that it does not appear as though one is cooking. (M.B. 41)
- ❖ This opinion is concerned that bread is a food that is easily cooked and for that reason one may not even add bread to a *kli sheni* and according to this opinion one should be stringent even regarding other foods. (M.B. 42)
- ❖ The lenient opinion contends that a *kli sheni* does not cook any food. (M.B. 43)
- ❖ This opinion maintains that baked and roasted food cannot be subsequently cooked. (M.B. 44)
- ❖ In other words one may not add bread to the soup of the *cholent* that is in a *kli sheni* and certainly it is prohibited to pour from a *kli rishon* onto bread. Those who cut onions and add them to their plate of *cholent* must wait until the *cholent* is no longer *yad soledes bo*. One must certainly avoid adding raw onions to food that is solid since there are authorities who maintain that solid food is treated like a *kli rishon*. (M.B. 45)
- ❖ *B'dieved*, it is not prohibited even if bread was added to a *kli rishon*. (M.B. 46)
- ❖ Pri Megadim is lenient concerning a *kli shlishi*. (M.B. 47)
- ❖ Chaye Adam writes that if the food or beverage is scalding, all opinions agree that it has the capacity to cook even if it is in a *kli sheni*. (M.B. 48)

Halacha Highlight

Yad nichvais bo

Shulchan Aruch Siman 318 Seif 5

כל זמן שהיד סולדת בו

As long as it remains *yad soledes bo*

Shulchan Aruch presents the position held by some authorities that foods that were baked or roasted will become cooked in the event that one places them in a pot of hot liquid (יש בישול אחר אפיה). Accordingly, it would be prohibited for one to place bread even into a *kli sheni* if the liquid inside is *yad soledes bo*. Shulchan Aruch notes that there are other authorities who are lenient and permit adding bread into a *kli sheni* and Rema references authorities who reject this principle and maintain that it is permitted for one to place bread even into a *kli rishon*. Rema concludes by relating that the custom is to be stringent and avoid adding bread to even a *kli sheni* as long as the liquid is *yad soledes bo*.

Mishnah Berurah (ס"ק מ"ח) cites Chaye Adam who maintains that if the liquid is *yad nichvais bo* all opinions would agree that it has the capacity to cook even in a *kli sheni*. Yad Yehudah (י"ד סי' ק"ייה פ"י הארוך סק"ט) explains that *yad nichvais bo* is a temperature which is so hot that one cannot insert his finger into the liquid without becoming scalded. Chochmas Adam (שערי צדק, שער מצוות הארץ פ"ב בינת אדם סק"ט) identifies the source for this position as the Yerushalmi in Maasros (1:4). Chazon Ish (א"י סי' נ"ב ס"ק י"ט) explains that although the Bavli disagrees with the Yerushalmi about this matter and in such a circumstance *halacha* should follow the Bavli's position, nevertheless, it is difficult to be lenient when it comes to Shabbos related matters even though it would seem that according to the letter of the law it should not be prohibited. Rav Shmuel HaLevi Vosner (שבט הלוי ח"ז סי' מ"ב) suggests that the rationale behind the stringency is that if the liquid is so hot that it could scald a person's hand it makes sense that it is potent enough to cook a food even in a *kli sheni*. Therefore, he maintains that although it is permitted to add water or oil to a *kli sheni* if the contents of the *kli sheni* are *yad nichvais bo*, one should not add them since they could become cooked.