The Chicago Center
Digest
Mishna Berura
THE DAILY RESOURCE FOR MISHNA BERURA YOMI
Mon, Jul 3 2023 ■ י"ד תמוז תשפ"ג
סימן רע"ט סעיף א'-ב'

Overview

Siman 279 Seif 1:

A lamp that was kindled for Shabbos may not be moved even after the flame went out. Similarly, leftover oil in a lamp that was kindled for Shabbos may not be removed to use for another purpose on that Shabbos.

- Since it was prohibited during bein hashemashos it remains muktzah for the remainder of Shabbos. (M.B. 1)
- The same is true concerning leftover fat and wax that was used as fuel on that Shabbos. (M.B. 2)
- Since one may not benefit from it for that Shabbos it is muktzah and may not be moved on that Shabbos. (M.B. 3)

Siman 279 Seif 2:

The lamp that we mentioned that cannot be moved, may not be moved even to use the object (צורך גופו) or because one needs the space where it is standing (צורך מקומו). There is an opinion that permits this but that position does not seem correct. Some maintain that someone who is delicate and finds the lamp repulsive may remove it since for him it is comparable to a chamber pot and one who is stringent will not lose.

- Since it was prohibited to move during bein hashemashos even for itself or for its place, it remains muktzah for the remainder of Shabbos. (M.B. 4)
- Bach and Magen Avrohom rule that it is not necessary for the person to be delicate. Once he declares that he finds the lamp repulsive he may move it. Bach implies that this is true only if the lamp is made from earthenware or wood but does not apply if the lamp is made from metal. Derech HaChaim writes that one should follow Shulchan Aruch and limits this ruling to one who is actually delicate. (M.B. 5)
- It should say, "One who is strict will be strict but one who is lenient will not lose." (M.B. 8)

Halacha Highlight

Muktzah status of a flame

Shulchan Aruch Siman 279 Seif 1
נר שהדליקו בו באותה שבת
A lamp that was kindled for that Shabbos

Shulchan Aruch (סעי' א') writes that it is prohibited to move a lamp that was kindled at the outset of Shabbos even after the flame is extinguished. The reason is that since the lamp was muktzah during bein hashemashos because it was a base for the flame that is muktzah it remains muktzah for the remainder of Shabbos even though the muktzah item no longer exists (מ"ב סק"א). Chazon Ish (או"ח סי' מ"א ס"ק ט"ז) explains that the flame is considered muktzah because while it remains burning people do not move it out of concern that the flame will go out. Any item that people do not move is, by definition muktzah, even if one benefits from that item on Shabbos.

Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach (שו"ת מנחת שלמה ח"א סי' י"ד) challenges this explanation since according to Chazon Ish if the lamp has glass around it so that there is no concern that the flame will go out it should not be muktzah as long as one intends to move it on Shabbos. Since we do not find the Poskim drawing such a distinction it must be that this is not the rationale why the flame is muktzah. Therefore, he explains that the flame is considered muktzah by virtue of the fact that it is not a kli – utensil. Furthermore, one cannot consider the flame to be part of the lamp since the flame is seen as an independent entity from the lamp either because of its importance or because it is constantly renewing itself. Rav Moshe Feinstein (או"ח ח"ג סי' נ') also explains this halacha in a similar manner and consequently asserts that one may adopt a lenient position regarding the question of moving electric appliances, e.g. a hot plate, an electric blanket, etc. Being that the wire that generates the heat is considered a kli it may be moved although there is a disagreement whether it is considered a kli shemelachto l'issur or l'heter (ע' מ"ב מהדורת דרשו סי' ש"ח הע' 12).