The Chicago Center
Digest
Mishna Berura
THE DAILY RESOURCE FOR MISHNA BERURA YOMI
Thurs, Feb 16 2023 ■ כ"ה שבט, תשפ"ג
סימן רנ"ג סעיף ב'

Overview

Siman 253 Seif 2 (b):

This applies only when the food is fully cooked and it may even be returned to a different kirah but if the food is not fully cooked it may not be returned even to the same kirah. Some authorities maintain that this restriction applies when one removed the food from the kirah before Shabbos and wants to return it on Shabbos but if it was removed on Shabbos, even if it was placed on the ground it is permitted. The custom is to follow the lenient opinion when it concerns our ovens that have the status of a kirah and they rely on the lenient position but it is correct to be stringent. If the food cooled down according to all opinions it is prohibited to return it to the kirah. Some authorities maintain that if food was removed from a tanur it may not be placed on pillows or blankets.

- If the food was not fully cooked it is possible for it to become cooked. (M.B. 61)
- It is permitted even if the second kirah is hotter than the first. If the food was insulated and one wants to place it on a kirah or vice versa it is prohibited since that is considered a new act of cooking. (M.B. 62)
- Rema refers to the requirement to keep the food in one's hand and intent to return it to the kirah. (M.B. 63)
- If the pot was not removed on Shabbos it appears as though it is being placed on the kirah for the first time and that is the reason it is necessary for it to remain in one's hands. (M.B. 64)
- This is true even if one did not intend to return it. (M.B. 65)
- In other words they return leftover cholent into the oven so that it does not cool down. (M.B. 66)
- Many authorities disagree with the lenient opinion and according to Bais Yosef even the lenient opinion only permits placing the food on the kirah but not inside of the kirah. However, there is merit to the lenient opinion since there are authorities who maintain that it is only prohibited to return the food if it could reach a boil again and that is uncommon. (M.B. 67)
- In other words, the food cooled off entirely and thus could be cooked a second time. Magen Avrohom writes that it is prohibited even if the food is dry because once it cools down entirely it is considered as though one is placing it in the oven in the first place on Shabbos. Later authorities write that when it is permitted to return the food it is also permitted to close the opening to the oven but if closing the opening will cause the food to boil it is better not to close it. All of this refers to where there are not coals that are burning but if there are coals that are burning it is prohibited. According to Yeshu'os Yaakov it is sufficient if the coals are pushed to one side of the oven. (M.B. 68)
- This represents the beginning of insulating the food. If the pot is not insulated well, meaning that it is open on top it is permitted since this is not called insulation. (M.B. 69)

Halacha Highlight

Returning cholent that contains uncooked chicken bones

Rema Siman 253 Seif 2 (b)
ודוקא שהתבשיל מבשל כל צרכו
Only if the food is fully cooked

Rema explains that the allowance to return food to a stovetop on Shabbos is predicated on the fact that the food is fully cooked. As long as the food is fully cooked it may even be returned to another stovetop. If the food is not fully cooked, it is prohibited to return it even to the same stovetop. Mishnah Berurah (סק"א) explains that if the food is not fully cooked it is not considered as though one is returning a food to the stovetop; rather it is considered an act of cooking. Biur Halacha (סי' שי"ח סע' ד' ד"ה שייך) writes that even in a circumstance in which one is uncertain whether a food is fully cooked one must adopt a stringent approach and not return the food to the stovetop since it may involve a transgression of the Biblical prohibition against cooking.

Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach (שו"ת מנחת שלמה ח"א סי' ו') cautioned those people who include chicken in their cholent that in order for it to be permitted for one to return the cholent to the blech one must be certain that the chicken bones are also fully cooked, i.e. soft enough to eat. If they are not, then the food may not be returned since further cooking will render the bones edible. Furthermore, even those people who do not commonly consume chicken bones are prohibited to return a cholent containing chicken bones to the blech if most people in that town do eat the bones. Rav Moshe Feinstein (שו"ת אג"מ או"ח ח"ד סי' ע"ו) wrote that generally there is no reason to be concerned that the bones will cook when the cholent is returned to the blech. However, in those places where it is common to eat the chicken bones, for example, in Eretz Yisroel, one may not be lenient. Rav Nissim Karelitz (חוט השני ח"ב פכ"ו סק"ב) also ruled that those people who eat the bones may not return the cholent to the blech if the bones are not fully cooked but for the majority of people who do not eat the bones there is no concern to return the cholent to the blech even though the bones are not fully cooked.