

Thurs, Feb 19, 2026 ■ ב' אדר, תשע"ז

סימן נ"ט סעיף א'-ב'

## Halacha Highlight

### Answering amen to *birchos krias shema*

Shulchan Aruch Siman 59 Seif 4

ולא יענה אמן אחר סיום הברוכה בעמו ישראך באחבה מושם זהוי הפסיק  
One should not answer upon the conclusion of the *beracha* of  
הברוך בעמו ישראך באחבה since it would constitute an interruption

Shulchan Aruch (ס"ק ד') writes that one should not answer after the *beracha* of the *birchos krias shema* since it would constitute an interruption between the *beracha* and *shema*. Mishnah Berurah (ס"ק כ"ד) explains that Shulchan Aruch maintains that just like generally one is not permitted to interrupt between the *beracha* and the *mitzvah* or between the *beracha* and eating so too one is not permitted to interrupt between *rabba* and *shema*. Kaf HaChaim (ס"ק כ"ו וכ"ח) relates that Sephardi custom not only refrains from answering amen to the *beracha* of the *birchos krias shema* but they also refrain from answering amen to *birchos krias shema* since that is also considered to be a *beracha* connected to *krias shema*.

Rema instructs us to look at his comments in siman 61. Mishnah Berurah (ס"ק כ"ח) explains that the custom is to finish the *beracha* before the *shaliach tzibbur* and to answer amen to his *beracha*. The reason is that *birchos krias shema* is not similar to other *birchos hamitzvah* since we do not say *kedushah* במצותינו וצונו לדורות שמען. This indicates that although it is referred to as one of *birchos krias shema*, nevertheless, it is an independent *beracha*. Later authorities cite Rema's position that one who finishes the *beracha* before the *shaliach tzibbur* should answer amen. *L'chatchila*, however, it is preferred for one to finish the *beracha* with the *shaliach tzibbur* so that he should not have to answer according to all opinions.

Eshel Avrohom (בוטשאטלעט) notes that if someone read *shema* before *davening*, e.g. he was concerned that the *minyan* would not reach *krias shema* in time, all opinions agree that he should answer amen since he is not fulfilling the *mitzvah* of *krias shema* with that reading.

## Stories to Share

### The Melody of the Reading

מ"ב ס' נ"ט, ס"ק י"א: "נכוו להדר אם אומר ביחיד לומר בניגון וטעמיים כקורא בתורה"

A certain Jew lived in a town with no regular *minyan*. As he was learning through the Mishnah Berurah he encountered the halachah on today's *amud* that one who davens without a *minyan* should say the *kedushah* of *Yotzer* to the tune of the *Torah* reading. He wondered about this. Was he really required to sing this section? Although the Rema brings that the custom is to be lenient and the *Biur HaGra* holds that this is the proper practice, the Mishnah Berurah holds that it is preferable to sing these *pesukim*. When he consulted the Kaf HaChaim, he saw the many poskim who hold like the Shulchan Aruch that one should sing this selection. He also noticed the ruling of the Kaf HaChaim himself that one should even sing this *kedushah* even when he prays with a *minyan* so that he will be accustomed to singing it. That way if he happens to pray alone on occasion, he will automatically sing the verses correctly. Of course, the Kaf HaChaim is a Sephardic source who most often follows the opinion of Rav Yosef Karo. This man wondered what he should do in actual practice.

When Rav Yosef Shov asked this question to Rav Nissin Karelitz, zt"l, he ruled that one need not sing this *kedushah*. "It is true that the Mish-

## Overview

### Siman 59 Seif 3:

According to some *kedusha* in the *beracha* of may be read by an individual since it is merely recounting what occurs but others maintain that an individual should skip it since it may only be read with the *tzibbur*. One should be concerned with the latter opinion and when being recited by an individual he should sing it with the *trup* as though he was reading the *pesukim* from the *Torah*. The custom is to follow the first opinion and an individual may say it. When answering this *kedusha* it should be done out loud.

- ❖ ואמרם ביראה קדוש ואופנים ברוך. Pri Chodosh writes that if a person is reading *kedusha* by himself because he arrived late but there is a *minyan* he may read it to himself since a *tzibbur* is present. (M.B. 10)
- ❖ Vilna Gaon agrees with second opinion but since one should not abandon a custom if it is recited by an individual he should read it with the *trup*. (M.B. 11)
- ❖ This *kedusha* should preferably be read while sitting. (M.B. 12)
- ❖ When recited as an individual it should be read quietly but according to others even an individual may read it out loud. (M.B. 13)

### Siman 59 Seif 4:

The *beracha* of *ערבית או יוצר או* should be read quietly with the *shaliach tzibbur*. One should finish ahead of the *shaliach tzibbur* so that one could answer amen after his *beracha*. However, if one did not say the *beracha* but merely heard the *shaliach tzibbur* read the *beracha* he fulfilled his obligation since the *shaliach tzibbur* can discharge the obligation for these *berachos* for individuals even for those who are capable of reciting the *beracha* for themselves. However, the *shaliach tzibbur* cannot discharge the obligation of an individual unless ten people are present. One should not answer after the *beracha* of *הברוך בעמו ישראך באחבה* since it would constitute an interruption. (See siman 61)

- ❖ Nowadays we are not particular to read the *beracha* quietly. (M.B. 14)
- ❖ It is only *berachos* of *shemone esrei* that a *shaliach tzibbur* may not say the *beracha* for one who could say the *beracha* by himself. (M.B. 20)
- ❖ Generally, one who has recited a *beracha* may repeat it for someone who is obligated to now recite that *beracha*. The exception to the rule is *berachos* on food which may not be repeated even for one who is not an expert in *berachos*. (M.B. 21)
- ❖ It is only regarding *birchos krias shema* and according to *Levush* even *birchos hashachar* that a *minyan* is required for the *shaliach tzibbur* to discharge the obligation of others but regarding other *berachos* one may recite the *beracha* for a friend. Regarding *birchos hanehenin* there are different rules and each halacha is discussed in its appropriate place. (M.B. 23)
- ❖ אף אמן would constitute an interruption between *krias shema* and the *beracha* of *rabba*. (M.B. 24)
- ❖ In siman 61 Rema relates that the custom is to finish the *beracha* before the *shaliach tzibbur* and to answer amen. Later authorities cite Rema's position that one should answer amen but preferably one should finish with the *shaliach tzibbur* so that one does not have to answer amen. (M.B. 25)

nah Berurah concludes that it is preferable for one who davens alone to recite it with the melody of a *Torah* reading. Nevertheless, I have never heard of anyone actually doing this while praying alone."

קובץ עניינים מובא בסוף חותמי על ר'יה, ע' שצ"ג