



# Halacha Highlight

## Answering *אמן* to *birchos krias shema*

Shulchan Aruch Siman 59 Seif 4

ולא יענה *אמן* אחר סיום הבורח בעמו ישראל באהבה משום דהוי הפסק

One should not answer *אמן* upon the conclusion of the *beracha* of *shema* since it would constitute an interruption

Shulchan Aruch (סעי' ד') writes that one should not answer *אמן* after the *beracha* of *shema* since it would constitute an interruption between the *beracha* and *shema*. Mishnah Berurah (ס"ק כ"ד) explains that Shulchan Aruch maintains that just like generally one is not permitted to interrupt between the *beracha* and the *mitzvah* or between the *beracha* and eating so too one is not permitted to interrupt between the *beracha* and *shema*. Kaf HaChaim (ס"ק כ"ו) relates that Sephardi custom not only refrains from answering *אמן* to the *beracha* of *shema* but they also refrain from answering *אמן* since that is also considered to be a *beracha* connected to *krias shema*.

Rema instructs us to look at his comments in *siman* 61. Mishnah Berurah explains that the custom is to finish the *beracha* before the *shaliach tzipbur* and to answer *אמן* to his *beracha*. The reason is that *birchos krias shema* is not similar to other *birchos hamitzvah* since we do not say *אמן* after it. This indicates that although it is referred to as one of *birchos krias shema*, nevertheless, it is an independent *beracha*. Later authorities cite Rema's position that one who finishes *אמן* before the *shaliach tzipbur* should answer *אמן*. *L'chatchila*, however, it is preferred for one to finish the *beracha* with the *shaliach tzipbur* so that he should not have to answer *אמן* according to all opinions.

Eshel Avrohom (בוטשאטש) notes that if someone read *shema* before *davening*, e.g. he was concerned that the *minyan* would not reach *krias shema* in time, all opinions agree that he should answer *אמן* since he is not fulfilling the *mitzvah* of *krias shema* with that reading.

# Stories to Share

## The Melody of the Reading

מ"ב סי' נ"ט, ס"ק י"א: "נכון להדר אם אומר ביחד לומר בניגון וטעמים כקורא בתורה"  
A certain Jew lived in a town with no regular minyan. As he was learning through the Mishnah Berurah he encountered the halachah on today's amud that one who davens without a minyan should say the kedushah of Yotzer to the tune of the Torah reading. He wondered about this. Was he really required to sing this section? Although the Rema brings that the custom is to be lenient and the Biur HaGra holds that this is the proper practice, the Mishnah Berurah holds that it is preferable to sing these pesukim. When he consulted the Kaf HaChaim, he saw the many poskim who hold like the Shulchan Aruch that one should sing this selection. He also noticed the ruling of the Kaf HaChaim himself that one should even sing this kedushah even when he prays with a minyan so that he will be accustomed to singing it. That way if he happens to pray alone on occasion, he will automatically sing the verses correctly. Of course, the Kaf HaChaim is a Sephardic source who most often follows the opinion of Rav Yosef Karo. This man wondered what he should do in actual practice.

When Rav Yosef Shov asked this question to Rav Nissim Karelitz, zt"l, he ruled that one need not sing this kedushah. "It is true that the Mish-

# Overview

## Siman 59 Seif 3:

According to some *kedusha* in the *beracha* of *יוצר* may be read by an individual since it is merely recounting what occurs but others maintain that an individual should skip it since it may only be read with the *tzipbur*. One should be concerned with the latter opinion and when being recited by an individual he should sing it with the *trup* as though he was reading the *pesukim* from the Torah. The custom is to follow the first opinion and an individual may say it. When answering this *kedusha* it should be done out loud.

- ❖ When skipping *kedusha* one should say *ואמרין ביראה קדוש ואופנים* וכי' ואומרין ברוך. Pri Chodosh writes that if a person is reading *kedusha* by himself because he arrived late but there is a *minyan* he may read it to himself since a *tzipbur* is present. (M.B. 10)
- ❖ Vilna Gaon agrees with second opinion but since one should not abandon a custom if it is recited by an individual he should read it with the *trup*. (M.B. 11)
- ❖ This *kedusha* should preferably be read while sitting. (M.B. 12)
- ❖ When recited as an individual it should be read quietly but according to others even an individual may read it out loud. (M.B. 13)

## Siman 59 Seif 4:

The *beracha* of *יוצר* and *עריבת* should be read quietly with the *shaliach tzipbur*. One should finish ahead of the *shaliach tzipbur* so that one could answer *אמן* after his *beracha*. However, if one did not say the *beracha* but merely heard the *shaliach tzipbur* read the *beracha* he fulfilled his obligation since the *shaliach tzipbur* can discharge the obligation for these *berachos* for individuals even for those who are capable of reciting the *beracha* for themselves. However, the *shaliach tzipbur* cannot discharge the obligation of an individual unless ten people are present. One should not answer *אמן* after the *beracha* of *יוצר* since it would constitute an interruption. (See *siman* 61)

- ❖ Nowadays we are not particular to read the *beracha* quietly. (M.B. 14)
- ❖ It is only *berachos* of *shemone esrei* that a *shaliach tzipbur* may not say the *beracha* for one who could say the *beracha* by himself. (M.B. 20)
- ❖ Generally, one who has recited a *beracha* may repeat it for someone who is obligated to now recite that *beracha*. The exception to the rule is *berachos* on food which may not be repeated even for one who is not an expert in *berachos*. (M.B. 21)
- ❖ It is only regarding *birchos krias shema* and according to Levush even *birchos hashachar* that a *minyan* is required for the *shaliach tzipbur* to discharge the obligation of others but regarding other *berachos* one may recite the *beracha* for a friend. Regarding *birchos hanehenin* there are different rules and each halacha is discussed in its appropriate place. (M.B. 23)
- ❖ *אמן* would constitute an interruption between *krias shema* and the *beracha* of *אברהם רבה*. (M.B. 24)
- ❖ In *siman* 61 Rema relates that the custom is to finish the *beracha* before the *shaliach tzipbur* and to answer *אמן*. Later authorities cite Rema's position that one should answer *אמן* but preferably one should finish with the *shaliach tzipbur* so that one does not have to answer *אמן*. (M.B. 25)

nah Berurah concludes that it is preferable for one who davens alone to recite it with the melody of a Torah reading. Nevertheless, I have never heard of anyone actually doing this while praying alone."

קובץ ענינים מובא בסוף חוט שני על ר"ה, ע' שצ"ג